PROPOSED WINDFARM AT SPRING FARM RIDGE, HELMDON/GREATWORTH, NORTHAMPTONSHIRE (SOUTH NORTHANTS COUNCIL PLANNING APPLICATION S/2010/1437/MAF)

PUBLIC INQUIRY INTO APPEAL AGAINST REFUSAL OF PLANNING PERMISSION APP/Z2830/A/11/2165035

STATEMENT BY RICHARD CHAMBERLAYNE OF CHURCH STREET, HELMDON

Wind turbines and public safety.

Broadview summarise their dissertation on Health and Safety with the statement "effects on public safety ...are considered to be Negligible and not Significant".

No accident statistics are given to back up this claim.

I contend that the statement is untrue. The possible risks (the chances of injury) may be relatively small but they are Very Significant.

The premise for this stated policy, seemingly common in the industry, is that to date there is no recorded incident of anyone having been injured or killed so turbines must be safe.

This is false logic. It simply means that such a tragedy has not happened yet.

The Internet is a source of much information relating to wind turbine malfunction. The most prolific website is that operated by the Caithness Windfarm Information Forum (CWIF) who has logged incidents over many years. As of 31 March 2012, they record 234 incidents of blade failure and 34 incidents of "ice throw". In Germany blade failure resulting in pieces 20 metres long flying over 150 metres and pieces 7metres in length over 200 metres. Debris has been recorded over 1.3 Km away and have been thrown over public roads and through brick walls. These recorded incidents will be the tip of the iceberg. Only when the public is involved will anything be known. The industry is not talking. I have tried to get information from manufacturers and insurers in respect of blade failure – they refuse to talk – a sure sign that all is not well.

In the UK later recorded incidents include the following:

| March | 2009 | Lincolnshire | Blade hub failure |
|-------|------|--------------|--------------------------|
| March | 2010 | Renfrewshire | Blade snapped off. |
| Dec | 2011 | Shetland | Blades and masts broken. |
| Jan | 2012 | Derbyshire | Blades snapped off. |
| | | Rhue Stoer | Blade failure. |
| | | Huddersfield | Blade failure. |

A look at <u>www.auchencorth.org.uk/documents</u> yields a list of European failures. An extract is attached. The majority of failures are in Germany because they have a large number of turbines. The message is clear – these machines fail with alarming frequency despite what the industry would have you believe.

The problem is that the turbines look so benign revolving gently against the sky. But consider: Rotating at 15 r.p.m the tip speed of such blades is 150 m.p.h. Typically blades weigh around 8 tonnes each and the rotor hub assembly 41 tonnes. This represents a lot of pent up energy even before they overspeed in high winds.

The technological envelope is being pushed as blades get larger. Manufacturers are wrestling with new materials and trying to improve fabrication techniques in an effort to make the blades sufficiently accurate, bigger and lighter but as cheap as possible. In such an environment safety cannot be guaranteed. On these new larger blades we have yet to see the effect of factors such as age, weather (including lightning strike) and fatigue.

Also remember the worst accidents happen when the safety systems fail – and they do.

In many other countries exclusion zones have been mandated to protect the public. Until the industry can guarantee safety, which is years away (perhaps never), we should do the same. Where countries have such a limit 1.5 Km is the norm.

Consider what is within 1.5 Km of these machines, at this proposed site at Spring Farm Ridge, the danger is obvious:

The whole of Greatworth, part of Helmdon (including the school), numerous other dwellings, a 4 km section of the busy and dangerous B4525, and around 19 km. of footpaths and bridleway are all at risk.

It also seems that members of the public are going to drive military vehicles around the turbines. You really could not make it up.

Please stop this madness before someone is seriously hurt or killed.

Attached: one page extract from auchencorth data.

| Fault | Year | Location | Report |
|--------------------------------|---------------------------|---|---|
| Blade Failure | 1992 | Delabole, Cornwall | Blades damaged by lightning |
| Blade Failure | 1993 | Cemmaes, Wates | Blade parts thrown over 400m |
| Blade Failure | 1995 | Rudersdorf, Germany | 11m long piece of blade landed next to childrens nursery |
| Blade Failure | 1995 | Tarifa, Spain | 2 separate occurrences of blades breaking off |
| Blade Failure | 1995 | Greece | Cracked blades |
| Blade Failure | 1996 | East Friesland, Holland | Parts of rotor blade reported landing in peoples garden |
| Blade Failure | 1996 | Eesmond, Holland | 2 blade failures in September |
| Blade Failure | 1996 | Schllewsig-Flensburg, Germany | Turbine blades broke and fell. Pieces landed on road and damaged adjacent turbine |
| Blade Failure | 1997 | Nordstrand, Germany | 2 of 3 blades fcame off. Parts flew over 300m, across a road |
| Blade Failure | 1997 | Waldaubach, Germany | Blade flew off, Parts found 400m to 500m away. Parts landed in summer house |
| Blade Failure | 1997 | Kaiser Withelm Koog, Germany | Blade parts flew up to 500m. 1 person killed |
| Blade Failure | 1997 | Wanderup, Germany | 66% of blade flew 50m, Road only 20m away |
| Blade Failure | 1997 | Taff Ely, Wales | Lightning strike |
| Blade Failure Blade Failure | 1997 | Four Burrows, Comwall | Lightning strike |
| | 1998 | Goonhilly, Cornwall | Lightning strike |
| Blade Failure | 1999 19 9 9 | Lower Saxony, Germany | Blade parts blown off, Parts found 100m away |
| Blade Failure Blade Failure | 1999 | Brandenburg, Germany | At least 20 separate blade parts up to 1m long, blown more than 300m |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Hachenburg, Germany | Blade parts flew almost 40m onto heavily used footpath, lightning strike |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Burmonken, Germany | Blade broke, Parts flew off |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Lower Saxony, Germany | Frozen blade detached and disintegrated, Parts flew 100m |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Wijnaldum, Holland | lightning strike destroyed turbine blades |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Lelystad, Holland | Blades from 4 turbines badly damaged by lightning |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Seglabera, Sweden | Blade parts flew almost 150m |
| Diage Falluse | 1999 | Sustrum, Germany | 7m long blade section flew more than 200m and 10 other pieces up to 1m long |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Alletedt Garmeny | 2 blade parts more than 20m look blave off and flow more than 150m |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Allstedt, Germany Blankenheim, Germany | 2 blade parts more than 20m long blown off and flew more than 150m. |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Germany | Blade fell to the ground |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | State of the control | lightning strike damaged blades Brake failure. Turbing turning to normal spaced, 60 residents within 500m even stod. |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Schleswig-Holstein, Germany Cuxhavn, Germany | Brake failure, Turbine turning 4x normal speed, 60 residents within 500m evacuated Blade blown off, Parts flew 200m |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Zennhusen, Germany | 2 turbines damaged by lightning. One lost a blade and 2 others shattered |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Lower Saxony, Germany | 2 turbines damaged by lightning. One lost a blade and 2 others shattered Blade destroyed by lightning |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Stoffin, Germany | Blade bent, hit tower. Debris over 50m circle |
| Blade Failure | 1999 | Leewarden, Holland | |
| Blade Failure | 2000 | Samso, Denmark | Sereious damage to blades following lightning strike |
| Diago : Gigie | 2000 | Camac, Dennark | Complete rotor and housing broken, 1 blade piece went through a window and landed in |
| Blade Failure | 2000 | Lower Saxony, Germany | swimming pool. Another piece was thrown 600m Storm tore nacell cover off. 1 blade flew 150m to 200m hitting factory and house, |
| Diago i anai a | 2500 | Lower Saxony, Germany | |
| | | | piercing 24cm thick stone wall, timber floor and roof. Turbines subsequently shut down |
| Blade Failure | 2000 | Lower Saxony, Germany | following court ruling on safety grounds. |
| Blade Failure | 2001 | | 21m blade section weighing 2t flew approx 100m |
| Blade Failure | 2001 | Lower Saxony, Germany Lower Saxony, Germany | 33m blade piece broke off and flew 100m |
| Blade Failure | 2001 | | 33m blade piece weighing 4t broke off and ffell to ground |
| Slade Failure | 2001 | Hessen, Germany Bad Doberan, Germany | 4m x 1m blade piece broke off and flew 150m |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Blyth, Northumberland | Turbine blade broke off. Nearby motorway closed off |
| Blade Faiture | 2002 | Lower Saxony, Germany | Broken blade on UK first offshore turbine |
| Blade Faiture | 2002 | Wormhout, France | Blade shattered with an audible crack. Debris scattered across surrounding fields |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Aachen, Germany | Blade torn off during a storm Turbine blade torn off during storm. 7.5m section flew 40m |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Westfalia, Germany | Loss of blade. 30m long section weighing 5.5t fell off. Smaller blade parts covered |
| | | Troomails, Gomilarly | an area to 400m from tower |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Westfalia, Germany | lightning strike broke off 1m of blade |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Saxony, Germany | Technical defect led to blade damage |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Westfalia, Germany | Blade broke off during storm |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Westfalia, Germany | Blade bent and fell to ground. Local farm evacuated |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Kaiserslautern, Germany | Blade broke off due to storm damage |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Brandenburg, Germany | 2 of 3 turbine blades tore off in a strom and thrown "far" |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Westfalia, Germany | Blade bent then broke in a storm |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Austria | Turbine blades damaged during storm |
| Blade Failure | 2002 | Esbjerg, Denmark | 3 blades experienced damage during commissioning |
| Blade Failure | 2003 | Aude, France | 3 blades from 3 separate turbines broke off during storm. 7 out of 10 turbines on this |
| 41300 TJAN238198CE | 3077 B. B. B. B. | ************************************** | site were shut down and dismantied |
| Blade Failure | 2003 | Lower Saxony, Germany | Lightning damage. Blade parts scattered over 150m |
| Blade Failure | 2003 | Lower Saxony, Germany | Lightning strike broke off blade tips |
| Blade Failure | 2003 | Rheinland-Pfalz, Germany | Lightning strike to 2 turbines damaging multiple blades on each |
| Blade Failure | 2003 | Saxony, Germany | Lightning damage to blade tips |
| Blade Failure | 2003 | Westfalia, Germany | Lightning damage to blade |
| Blade Failure | 2003 | Westfalia, Germany | 37m long blade section bent in storm |
| Blade Failure | 2003 | Saxony, Germany | Lightning strike destroyed blade, started fire and damaged turbine housing. 1 blade |
| | | 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 00 | bent. Another fell off. |
| Blade Failure | 2003 | Boulogne sur Mer, France | Blade parts weighing several tons fell ino an area used by fishermen and walkers |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | East Belgium | Lightning strike led to exploding blade |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Zeeland, Holland | 3 blades exploded ue to lightning strike |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Lower Saxony, Germany | 2t piece of blade broke off and flew 66m |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Hessen, Germany | Blades torn off in a storm |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Saxony, Germany | 10m section of blade flew 20m. 6m piece flew 40m. Smaller pieces flew out to 200m. |
| | 57.7.7.5X | | Suspected lightning damage a week earlier. |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Saxony, Germany | Rotor bent during storm, some pieces flew off |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Saxony, Germany | 10m blade section broke off |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Lower Saxony, Germany | Lightning strike destroyed blades close to motorway |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Rheinland-Pfalz, Germany | Broken rotor |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Brittany, France | Blade bent and damaged tower |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Brittany, France | |
| | | | 2nd incident in 10 days, 2.5m long pieces of blade found in field |
| Blade Failure | 2004 | Zeebrugge, Belgium | 3t rotor blade became detached and flew 100m landing not far from nearby gas terminal |